

lacked any civic responsibility. While not wishing to swing to the other extreme and offer apologies for Ottoman maladministration and corruption, it is important to note that the period under review witnessed the incipient financial bankruptcy of the Ottoman state and the gradual ceding, under the terms of the capitulation agreements, of centralized authority over Jerusalem. Urban planning and the provision of services were not priorities for an administration strapped for funds. In addition, it is important to remember that Arab settlement and construction was generally a clan or family affair that took place within certain geographical confines. There was little need for planning regulation when construction was communal or occurred after extensive consultation and joint financing. This is not to claim that there were no disputes—*Shari'ah* court records readily testify to their existence. But the long-established Arab population in Jerusalem had abided by customary practices that did not require the formality of the bylaws that the new immigrants sought. Kark concedes this point only in passing, rather than as a counterpoint to the main thrust of her argument, which serves to denigrate non-Western planning practices (p. 83).

Finally, it simply is not accurate to write that there was no urban planning during the late Ottoman period in Jerusalem. Soon after its establishment in 1863, the Jerusalem municipal council sought to pave the streets, clean and light the city, remove impediments to traffic, and improve the water supply. From the 1870s to 1914 a sewage system was installed and gradually expanded, public conveniences were introduced, and rubbish was collected regularly. In 1892, a city park was opened and trees were planted along the main streets. In 1886, a city police force was established, in 1891 a municipal hospital was built, and in 1900 a public fountain was installed. In 1868 a carriage road to Jaffa was built, followed by a network of roads to Ramallah, Nablus, Bethlehem, Hebron, and Jericho, and in 1892 the Jaffa-Jerusalem railway was completed.* Even without mentioning the more traditional planning and construction practices of the *waqfs*, the extent of urban planning was considerable. Kark's study is a useful and valuable contribution to the corpus of literature on Jerusalem, but it

* Alexander Schölch, "Jerusalem in the 19th Century (1831-1917 A.D.)," in *Jerusalem in History*, ed. Kamil J. al-'Asali (London: Scorpion Publishing, 1989), pp. 228-48.

presents only a partial perspective of the development of Jerusalem during this period.

PALESTINE TO 1948

A Survey of Palestine and Supplement to Survey of Palestine. London: Her Majesty's Stationary Office, 1946-1947. Reprinted by The Institute for Palestine Studies, Washington D.C., 1991. Two volumes, 1,036 pages. Appendices to p. 1,078. Index to p. 1,139. **Supplement**, 153 pages. The set, \$49.85 cloth, \$29.95 paper.

Before Their Diaspora: A Photographic History of the Palestinians, 1876-1948, by Walid Khalidi. Washington, D.C.: The Institute for Palestine Studies, 1991 (original ed. 1984). 351 pages. \$49.00 cloth, \$29.00 paper.

Reviewed by **Benny Morris**

The Institute for Palestine Studies has done students and historians of modern Middle East history and the Israeli-Arab conflict a major service by reprinting the classic *Survey of Palestine*, prepared by the British Palestine Mandate government from December 1945 to January 1946 for presentation to the Anglo-American Committee of Inquiry. The *Supplement*, prepared for presentation to the United Nations Special Committee on Palestine, updated the facts and figures in the *Survey* up to the end of spring 1947.

The *Survey*, written with an eye to "complete objectivity," in the words of its authors, is the most comprehensive and accurate review of the social, economic, demographic, and political conditions and developments, facts and figures, pertaining to Palestine during the years of the British Mandate.

The first hundred pages of the *Survey* briefly outline the principal events between the British conquest of Palestine and the end of the Mandate. They are a model of objectivity (of the sort which most probably annoyed both its Arab and Jewish readers back in 1947 and probably will annoy some of them today).

The entry for "April, 1920 (Easter Sunday)" reads: "Savage attacks were made by

Benny Morris is the author of *The Birth of the Palestinian Refugee Problem, 1947-1949* (Cambridge, 1988), and of *1948 and After: Israel and the Palestinians* (Oxford, 1990).

Arab rioters in Jerusalem on Jewish lives and property. Five Jews were killed and 211 injured." Or "January, 1942":

A group of terrorists which, under the leadership of Abraham Stern, had broken away from the Irgun Zvai Leumi in October, 1939, and had been engaged in terrorist acts since . . . June, 1940, came into prominence with a series of robberies and murders in the Tel Aviv area. . . . Jewish public opinion openly supported the drastic police measures taken against the gang. . . .

The following thousand-odd pages provide statistics on population growth and immigration, agricultural produce and cultivation, industrial output and plants, fishing, construction, communications and transport, and so on.

Few will read these volumes from cover to cover, at a sitting. But they are an essential reference work for anyone interested in the history of the Palestine problem. If not pretending to supply understanding, at least they furnish the rudimentary facts and figures that all too often are ignored or abused in the literature.

A radically different order of service has been rendered by the Institute with the republication of *Before Their Diaspora*, which photographically describes Palestinian Arab society and selected events in Palestinian history between the last decades of Ottoman rule and the end of the Mandate. The photographs are accompanied by introductory texts and descriptive captions. Not feigning or aspiring to objectivity, Khalidi is above all an eloquent proponent of the Palestinian cause. The portrait painted in these 427 photographs in this beautifully crafted volume and the accompanying texts is both moving and slanted.

The book represents at once an effort to capture in freeze-frames a society that is about to vanish and an effort to capture and describe a people in the throes of historical movement and convulsion. The freeze-frames succeed; the motion of history less so. One gets a feel of the texture of Palestinian rural and urban society on either side of 1900 moving into the twentieth century. One is presented with a portrait of a blameless society shambling towards tragedy. The villains of the piece—the wily, brutal predator (the Zionists) and the predator's wily-cum-bumbling patron (Britain)—are forever there, in the wings, almost never in the photographs, but always larger-than-life in the text. Perhaps there is a lesson here about the (necessarily?) treacherous connection between history and photography.

Doing both more and less than justice to his people, Khalidi presents the Palestinians as objects rather than subjects, done upon and by rather than doing. Yet the Palestinian tragedy, as it unfolded between 1917 and 1948, had as much to do with things done and not done by the Palestinians and their more and less sincere Arab supporters as by the Zionists and the British.

As history, the volume suffers from a wide range of factual errors and judgmental lapses or distortions that Khalidi and his editors might well have corrected between the appearance of the original edition and this reprint. Given the publication during the 1980s of a series of accurate and balanced accounts of the 1948 war, there is no reason for Khalidi to have written that "on 21 April the British announced their withdrawal from Haifa" (p. 312). The British announced not "withdrawal from Haifa" but from certain positions along the Arab-Jewish seam in Haifa; indeed, they were to remain in certain areas of the city for weeks after the end of the Mandate. Or to have written that Arab Haifa "fell on April 22-23" (p. 312), when in fact Arab Haifa fell to the Haganah on 21-22 April, the battle ending in the afternoon of 22 April. The Haganah attack on Arab Tiberias, on 16-17 April, preceded the British announcement of withdrawal from the city. 'Abd al-Qadir al-Husayni did not die "as he led a successful counterattack" at Castel (p. 310), rather, he was shot by a Jewish sentry as he approached Castel, which he apparently believed was already in Arab hands. And so on.

But worse than such small errors of fact are lapses of judgment and half-truths that clearly stem from the passionately partisan perspective that Khalidi makes no effort to hide. The author makes no bones about the Palestinian (and pan-Arab) rejection of the UN General Assembly partition resolution of 29 November 1947, even while describing it as "a nonmandatory recommendation" (p. 306). But why, then, does he glide over the fact that the Palestinian Arabs launched the hostilities that evolved into the 1948 war? Is not the sentence "Haganah attacks on villages and residential quarters were answered by Palestinian attacks on Zionist colonies, and vice versa" (p. 309) a major distortion, and one clearly meant to deceive? Similarly, the fact that the armies of Egypt, Syria, Iraq, and Lebanon invaded the territory of the Jewish state-to-be on 15 May 1948, with the aim of destroying it, is somehow lost in the verbiage.

Khalidi's elisions range well beyond Palestine. On what does he—can he—base his assertion that "To be sure, the Soviet Union

voted for partition [in 1947] . . . only in order to end British rule in Palestine"? Yet Khalidi a few pages earlier (p. 244) asserts that Britain had already decided to quit Palestine and had announced its intention before the Soviets announced their support of partition and voted for it. Anyway, how can—does—Khalidi know what was on Stalin's mind? How about: The Soviets voted for partition because they regarded partition as a fair and equitable solution to the Jewish-Palestinian conflict? Or: The Soviets supported partition both because they wanted to see a fair solution and because they hoped to undermine Western influence in the Middle East?

Khalidi repeatedly refers to the service of Palestinians in the Allies' ranks in World War II. But he fails completely to mention al-Hajj Amin al-Husayni's services (recruitment, propaganda) on behalf of Nazi Germany during the war.

Far worse, in describing the Arab Rebellion of 1936-39 (pp. 190-91), Khalidi fails altogether to mention the basic internal divisions in the Palestinian camp, the terrorist campaign the Husaynis waged against the Nashashibi-led opposition, and the emergence of the Arab "Peace Bands," which fought against the rebels in the last months of the revolt and helped bring about its demise.

Given that the volume is about the Palestinians, Khalidi was probably right in largely omitting photographs of the Zionist enterprise in Palestine. But a little more attention to the Jewish side might have made the book a little more enlightening (not to say fairer). It is symptomatic of the narrow Palestinian focus that, while referring repeatedly to the Wailing Wall, nowhere does Khalidi explain what it is (i.e., the only remaining part of the wall that surrounded the Jewish Temple, the holiest site in Judaism). Instead, Khalidi describes the Wailing Wall as the nether side of a wall to which Muhammad had tethered his horse while in transit, after his death, between Mecca and heaven (p. 21). Khalidi's point—why Muslims (and Christian Arabs) are attached to Jerusalem—is clear. But why are Jews attached to Jerusalem? Surely a few words would have been in order.

All of which is a shame because as a photographic-historical essay, *Before Their Diaspora* must surely rank as a major achievement.

THE VILLAGE AND THE INTIFADA

A Season of Stones: Living in a Palestin-

ian Village, by Helen Winternitz. New York: The Atlantic Monthly Press, 1991. xiv + 300 pages. Glossary to p. 303. Maps. \$21.95 cloth.

Reviewed by **Mouin Rabbani**

An outstanding feature of the current popular uprising in the occupied Palestinian territories has been the total mobilization of West Bank villages alongside the cities and refugee camps. Where these approximately 400 rural communities of various sizes claimed only a partial and limited role in previous rebellions against Israeli rule, they have been in the forefront of resistance during the intifada. Indeed, the somewhat sudden and massive participation of Palestinian villages in the uprising during the first months of 1988 propelled it to new heights at a time when collapse loomed menacingly on the horizon, and defined it as a truly national endeavor. And since that initial eruption of protest, village communities have continued to contribute disproportionately to both the struggle and suffering that characterize the revolt.

Helen Winternitz, an American travel writer and journalist, spent a year living in one such community, the West Bank village of Nahalin, near Bethlehem. She arrived in the spring of 1988 as Palestinian villages were decisively entering the fray, and departed shortly after the multiple killings at Nahalin on 13 April 1989, the first and as yet bloodiest of what have become annual Ramadan killings perpetrated by the Israeli military.* *A Season of Stones* is the product of that experience.

Written in the style of a travelogue, "this account is not first about the uprising . . . [nor] an analysis of the Palestinians." It is, rather, "an amalgamation of stories that chronicle a year in the lives of some of the villagers of Nahalin," and a narrative "about village-sized truths that have much larger import" (p. xiv). As with much travel literature, it is also a chronicle of a highly self-conscious outsider's own voyage of discovery and her attempts to enter a community in order to understand it. Within this framework, the book

Mouin Rabbani is a Ph.D. candidate in Middle East history at the University of Durham.

* Subsequent killings of Palestinians by the Israeli military during the Muslim holy month of Ramadan or its concluding holiday, 'Id al-Fitr, occurred in Nusayrat Refugee Camp (6 May 1989), Jabalya Refugee Camp (27 April 1990), and Rafah Refugee Camp (29 March 1991 and 1 April 1992). All of these locations are in the Gaza Strip, and were accompanied by further incidents elsewhere in the occupied territories.